

# VU Research Portal

## Reformed and Anabaptist dialogue on the Imitation of Christ

Joustra, J.R.

2019

### **document version**

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

### **citation for published version (APA)**

Joustra, J. R. (2019). *Reformed and Anabaptist dialogue on the Imitation of Christ: Exploring Herman Bavinck and John Howard Yoder's thought on following the example of Jesus*. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

### **General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

### **Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

### **E-mail address:**

[vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl](mailto:vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl)

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

---

### *List of Abbreviations*

v

### **Chapter One – What Would Jesus Do?: Evangelical Ethics and the Imitation of Christ**

“WWJD?”: When Imitating Christ Became Cool	1
The Imitation Tradition in North American Evangelicalism	2
The Imitation of Christ Throughout Church History	5
The Oddity of Imitating Christ in the Dutch Reformed Tradition	7
A Brief History of the Imitation of Christ in Neo-Calvinist Ethics	9
Neo-Calvinists and the Imitation of Christ	20
Thesis	27
A New Discovery: Bavinck’s <i>Reformed Ethics</i>	29
A Contemporary Voice on the Imitation of Christ: John Howard Yoder	30
Chapter Summary	37

### **Chapter Two – Imitating Christ Throughout the Ages: A Brief Survey of the Imitation Tradition in the History of Christian Spirituality**

Introduction: The Challenge of Discerning a Proper Imitation of Christ	42
Looking to Scripture: North American Evangelical Trends in Imitation Scholarship	44
Looking to Scripture <i>and</i> Tradition: John Howard Yoder and Herman Bavinck	49
The Imitation of Christ in the New Testament	51
Early Christian Martyrdom and the Imitation of Christ	53
The Ascetic Movement and the Imitation of Christ	57
The Mendicant Orders and the Imitation of Christ	60
Thomas à Kempis and the Imitation of Christ	64
The Reformation and the Imitation of Christ	68
Building on the Foundation of the Reformers: Bavinck and Calvin	72

### **Chapter Three – Imitation in the Thought of Herman Bavinck: Law-Patterned Imitation of the Virtues of Christ**

Introduction	79
Herman Bavinck: Reformed Dogmatician and Ethicist	81
Survey of Scholarship on Bavinck and the Imitation of Christ	84
An Unpublished Treasure: van Keulen’s Remarks on Bavinck’s <i>Reformed Ethics</i>	85
An Intuitive Understanding: John Bolt’s Dissertation on the Imitation of Christ	86
Bolt, Eglinton, and van Keulen: Other Essays on the Imitation of Christ	89
Bookending His Career: Bavinck’s Essays on the Imitation of Christ	93

Imitation I: An Evaluation of Prominent Imitation Ideals Throughout History	94
Imitation II: Upholding the Imitation of Christ in the Modern World	102
Continuity in Bavinck's Thought: The Relationship Between Imitation I and II	108
Continuity Extended: The Relationship Between the Imitation of Christ and Other Dominant Themes in Bavinck's Thought	111
Imitating Christ in <i>Reformed Dogmatics</i>	118
Imitating Christ on Account of the Work of Christ	120
"Become What You Are!" Imitation of Christ as Sanctified Believers	123
Further Evidence for the Imitation of Christ in Bavinck's <i>Dogmatics</i>	125
Imitating Christ in <i>Reformed Ethics</i>	128
A Consistent Theme: Imitation Throughout Bavinck's Corpus	140
"Christian Principles and Social Relationships": Following The Example of Christ in Society	141
Imitating Christ's Virtues in "Christ and Christianity"	145
Imitation Applied: The Example of Christ in the Life of the Family	147
Conclusion: Bavinck's Contribution to a Reformed Understanding of the Imitation of Christ	152

#### **Chapter Four – Imitation in the Thought of John Howard Yoder: Imitating Jesus in his Cross**

Introduction	163
John Howard Yoder and His Influence	165
John Howard Yoder: Mennonite, evangelical, and catholic	167
Recent Revelations Regarding Yoder's Sexual Abuse	169
Yoder's Influence on Social Ethics and Evangelical Action	180
The Particular Influence of <i>The Politics of Jesus</i>	182
Following Jesus: What Other Ethics Misunderstand About Christ	185
Defining Terms: Yoder's use of <i>Imitatio Christ</i> Language	188
Yoder's Use of Imitation Language: A Survey	189
Yoder's Rejection of Historic Versions of the Imitation of Christ	192
Yoder's Early Discussion of Imitating Christ	194
The Meaning of "The Cross" in Yoder's Thought	199
Yoder's Biblical Justification for a Proper Imitation of Christ	208
The Imitation of Christ as Inherently Political	215
Yoder's Imitation Ethic in Concrete Christian Life	222
Imitating Christ in "Revolutionary Subordination"	224
Imitating Christ in the Practices of the Church	228
Conclusion	232

#### **Chapter Five – Herman Bavinck and John Howard Yoder in Dialogue: Common Affirmations on the Imitation of Christ**

Introduction	235
Mouw and Yoder: Reframing the Relationship	239
Willem Balke: The Relationship Between Calvin and the Early	242

Anabaptists	
Leonard Verduin: An Analysis of Historic Differences Between the Reformed and Anabaptist Traditions	245
Specifying the Question: Branson Parlor on John Howard Yoder and Neo- Calvinism	249
Alongside the Academy: National and International Reformed-Anabaptist Ecumenical Dialogues	255
The Posture of Mennonites in Dialogue	257
National and International Dialogues Between Reformed and Mennonite Traditions	262
Continuing the Conversation: Yoder and Bavinck in Dialogue	271
Yoder and Bavinck's Shared Emphases on the Imitation of Christ	276
The Imitation of Christ as an Ethic for Christians	278
"Restored to Our Destiny": The Imitation of Christ, Creation, and Redemption	279
Differing Interpretations of a Shared Framework: Bavinck And Yoder on Postlapsarian Noetic Access to God's Created Intent	286
A Historical Addendum: Ontological Differences Regarding Nature and Grace	288
The Imitation of Christ as an All-of-life Encompassing Ethic	300
The Imitation of Christ as a Qualified Ethic	306
Not the Martyr, the Mystic, the Monk, or the Modernist: A Shared Rejection of Historic Forms of the Imitation of Christ	309
The Martyr	310
The Monk	313
The Mystic	316
The Modernist	319
Conclusion	322

## **Chapter Six – Furthering the Conversation: The Maintained Disagreements between Herman Bavinck and John Howard Yoder on the Imitation of Christ**

Introduction	325
Differences Between Yoder and Bavinck on the Imitation of Christ	326
Focal Images	327
Christology and the Role of Suffering	330
The Church and the World	340
Yoder and Bavinck's Explicit Critiques of the Other's Tradition	354
Dualism and the Literal Repetition of Jesus' Deeds: Bavinck's Critique of Anabaptism	354
An Ethic for all, or an Ethic for Christians: Yoder's Critique of the Reformed Tradition	356
Going Beyond the Received Wisdom: Responding to the Critiques	360
Furthering the Conversation: The Implicit Critiques of Yoder and Bavinck	370
Yoder's Implicit Critique of Bavinck's Imitation Ethic	370
Do the Powers Maintain their Power?	371
What of the Church and the Broader Society?	372

Is the Imitation of Christ <i>Really</i> a Political Calling?	374
Has the Church Truly Grasped the Extent of Christ's Suffering?	375
Bavinck's Implicit Critique of Yoder's Imitation Ethic	377
Can the Cross Explain all of Morality?	378
Can a Focus on Suffering Adequately Anticipate the Eschaton?	379
Does not an Ethical Atonement Presume Juridical Benefits of the Atonement?	381
Conclusion	384

## **Chapter Seven – Following the Way of Jesus: A Reformed, Evangelical Imitation Ethic in the Twenty-First Century**

Introduction	389
An Ethic in Jeopardy? Deep Disagreements about the Nature of the Imitation of Christ	391
A Way Forward: Herman Bavinck and John Howard Yoder in Dialogue	392
Bavinck and Yoder: Familial Disputes on the Imitation of Christ	394
A Diverse Family Identity: Unique and Shared Affirmations on the Imitation of Christ	399
Bavinck and Yoder in Dialogue: A Bridge Across North American Evangelical Divisions	404
“What is Missing?” Bavinck's Challenges and Correctives to Yoder's Theological Emphases	409
Not Just Bavinck, But Yoder: The Correctives Yoder Offers to the Neo-Calvinist Tradition	413
Relating Piety and Practice	414
Contextual Analysis in the Twenty-First Century	418
Common Grace and the “Otherness” of Christians	422
A Reformed Articulation of the Imitation of Christ in the Twenty-First Century	426
Conclusion: Following Jesus: The Shape of the Christian Life	431

### *Works Cited*

